22

23

24

Kevin H. Breck, WSBA # 39183 WINSTON & CASHATT 601 W. Riverside, Ste. 1900 Spokane, WA 99201 (509) 838-6131

Facsimile: (509) 838-1416

E-mail: khb@winstoncashatt.com

Attorney for Equifax Information Services, LLC

# UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON

PAUL SLOWEY,

Plaintiff.

No. 3:09-cv-5162

VS.

EQUIFAX INFORMATION SERVICES, LLC et al,

Defendants.

DEFENDANT EQUIFAX INFORMATION SERVICES, LLC'S ANSWER AND DEFENSES TO PLAINTIFF'S COMPLAINT

COMES NOW, Defendant Equifax Information Services LLC ("Equifax"), successor in interest to Equifax Credit Information Services Inc., by and through its Counsel, and pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 8 and 12, hereby files its answer and defenses to Plaintiff's Complaint as follows:

1. Equifax is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in Paragraph 1 of Plaintiff's Complaint.

DEFENDANT EQUIFAX INFORMATION SERVICES, LLC'S ANSWER AND DEFENSES TO PLAINTIFF'S COMPLAINT – Page 1 (CASE # 3:09-cv-5162)

- 2. Equifax admits the first sentence of Paragraph 2 of Plaintiff's Complaint. In response to the second sentence of Paragraph 2 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Equifax states that Equifax Information Services LLC is successor in interest to Equifax Credit Information Services Inc. Equifax denies the third sentence of Paragraph 2 of Plaintiff's Complaint and states there is no corporation named Equifax Commercial Services, Inc.
- 3. Equifax is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in Paragraph 3 of Plaintiff's Complaint.
- 4. Equifax is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in Paragraph 4 of Plaintiff's Complaint.
- 5. Equifax admits the allegations contained in Paragraph 5 of Plaintiff's Complaint.
- 6. Equifax is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in Paragraph 6 of Plaintiff's Complaint.

DEFENDANT EQUIFAX INFORMATION SERVICES, LLC'S ANSWER AND DEFENSES TO PLAINTIFF'S COMPLAINT - Page 2 (CASE # 3:09-cv-5162)

- 7. Equifax is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in Paragraph 7 of Plaintiff's Complaint.
- 8. Equifax admits it received a dispute from Plaintiff in January 2009 and conducted an investigation. Equifax is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the remaining allegations contained in Paragraph 8 of Plaintiff's Complaint.
- 9. Equifax denies the allegations contained in Paragraph 9 as they pertain to Equifax. Equifax is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the remaining allegations contained in Paragraph 9 of Plaintiff's Complaint.
- 10. Equifax denies the allegations contained in Paragraph 10 of Plaintiff's Complaint.
- 11. Equifax denies the allegations contained in Paragraph 11 as they pertain to Equifax. Equifax is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the remaining allegations contained in Paragraph 11 of Plaintiff's Complaint.

DEFENDANT EQUIFAX INFORMATION SERVICES, LLC'S ANSWER AND DEFENSES TO PLAINTIFF'S COMPLAINT – Page 3 (CASE # 3:09-cv-5162)

- 12. Equifax denies that plaintiff is entitled to any of the relief set forth in Paragraph 12 of Plaintiff's Complaint.
- 13. Equifax denies that plaintiff is entitled to any of the relief set forth in Paragraph 13 of Plaintiff's Complaint.

## **Prayer for Relief**

Equifax denies that plaintiff is entitled to the relief sought in this paragraph.

Any allegations contained in Plaintiff's Complaint not specifically responded to above are hereby expressly denied.

#### **DEFENSES**

Without assuming the burden of proof where it otherwise rests with Plaintiff,

Defendant Equifax pleads the following defenses to the Complaint:

## **FIRST DEFENSE**

Plaintiff's Complaint fails, in whole or in part, to state a claim against Equifax upon which relief can be granted.

DEFENDANT EQUIFAX INFORMATION SERVICES, LLC'S ANSWER AND DEFENSES TO PLAINTIFF'S COMPLAINT – Page 4 (CASE # 3:09-cv-5162)

4

6

7

5

8

9

10 11

12

13 14

15

16 17

18

19

20

21 22

23

24

#### **SECOND DEFENSE**

Plaintiff's damages, if any, were not caused by Equifax, but by other persons or entities for whom or for which Equifax is not responsible.

## **THIRD DEFENSE**

Equifax maintained reasonable procedures to assure maximum possible accuracy in its credit reports.

#### **FOURTH DEFENSE**

Equifax has complied with the provisions of the Fair Credit Reporting

Act in its handling of Plaintiff's credit file, and is entitled to each and every

defense afforded to it by that statute.

## **FIFTH DEFENSE**

Plaintiff has failed to mitigate his damages, if any.

## **SIXTH DEFENSE**

Plaintiff has not alleged any injury in fact.

## SEVENTH DEFENSE

Plaintiff has not sustained any damages.

DEFENDANT EQUIFAX INFORMATION SERVICES, LLC'S ANSWER AND DEFENSES TO PLAINTIFF'S COMPLAINT – Page 5 (CASE # 3:09-cv-5162)

8

13

14 15

16

17

18

19

20 21

22

23

24

#### **EIGHTH DEFENSE**

Plaintiff's damages, if any, are caused by his own acts or omissions, or the acts or omissions of third parties other than Equifax.

#### **NINTH DEFENSE**

Plaintiff's Complaint seeks the imposition of punitive damages. Equifax adopts by reference the defenses, criteria, limitations, standards and constitutional protections mandated or provided by the United States Supreme Court in the following cases: <a href="May.16.2">BMW v. Gore</a>, 517 U.S. 559 (1996); <a href="Cooper Indus.">Cooper Indus.</a>, <a href="Inc. v. Leatherman Tool Group, Inc.">Inc. v. Leatherman Tool Group, Inc.</a>, 532 U.S. 923 (2001) and <a href="State Farm v.">State Farm v.</a></a></a> <a href="Campbell">Campbell</a>, 538 U.S. 408 (2003).

## TENTH DEFENSE

Plaintiff cannot establish the standard of willfulness under the Fair Credit Reporting Act as articulated by the Supreme Court in <u>Safeco Insurance Co.</u> of America v. Burr, 127 S. Ct. 2201 (2007).

## ELEVENTH DEFENSE

Equifax reserves the right to assert additional defenses that it learns through the course of discovery.

DEFENDANT EQUIFAX INFORMATION SERVICES, LLC'S ANSWER AND DEFENSES TO PLAINTIFF'S COMPLAINT – Page 6 (CASE # 3:09-cv-5162)

WHEREFORE, having fully answered or otherwise responded to the allegations contained in Plaintiff's Complaint, Equifax prays that:

- (1) Plaintiff's Complaint be dismissed in its entirety and with prejudice, with all costs taxed against plaintiff;
  - (2) That Equifax be dismissed as a party to this action;
- (3) That Equifax recover from plaintiff its expenses of litigation, including attorney's fees; and
- (4) That Equifax recover such other and additional relief, as the Court deems just and appropriate.

DATED this 30<sup>th</sup> day of March, 2009.

s/Kevin H. Breck, WSBA No. 39183 WINSTON & CASHATT 601 W. Riverside, Ste. 1900 Spokane, WA 99201 (509) 838-6131 Facsimile: (509) 838-1416

E-mail: khb@winstoncashatt.com

Attorney for Equifax Information Services, LLC

DEFENDANT EQUIFAX INFORMATION SERVICES, LLC'S ANSWER AND DEFENSES TO PLAINTIFF'S COMPLAINT – Page 7 (CASE # 3:09-cv-5162)

10

11

12

13

14 15

16

17

18

19 20

21

22

23

24

I hereby certify that on March 30, 2009, I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF System which will send notification of such filing to the following:

Ben Shafton Caron, Colven, Robison & Shafton, P.S. 900 Washington St., Suite 1000 Vancouver, WA 98660 Attorney for Plaintiff

s/Kevin H. Breck, WSBA No. 39183

WINSTON & CASHATT 601 W. Riverside, Ste. 1900 Spokane, WA 99201 (509) 838-6131

Facsimile: (509) 838-1416

E-mail: khb@winstoncashatt.com

Attorney for Equifax Information Services, LLC

DEFENDANT EQUIFAX INFORMATION SERVICES, LLC'S ANSWER AND DEFENSES TO PLAINTIFF'S COMPLAINT – Page 8 (CASE # 3:09-cv-5162)